



OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
SINDH INSTITUTE OF OPHTHALMOLOGY
& VISUAL SCIENCES HYDERABAD

SUBJECT: MINUTES OF 16th MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS OF SINDH INSTITUTE OF OPHTHALMOLOGY & VISUAL SCIENCES HELD ON SATURDAY, 13TH DECEMBER, 2024.

The 16th meeting of the Board of Directors (BoDs) of Sindh Institute of Ophthalmology & Visual Sciences (SIOVS) was held at 12:00 p.m. 13th December, 2024 in the Committee Room, 3rd Floor, New Building-1 Sindh Secretariat, Karachi as per the Section 10 sub section 1 of SIOVS Act 2013, as amended in 2019, chaired by **Mr. Rehan Iqbal Baloch**, Honorable Secretary, Health Department, Government of Sindh. The following members attended the meeting:

Mr. Rehan Iqbal Baloch Honorable Secretary, Health Department, Government of Sindh	Chairperson
Mr. Abdul Aleem Memon President of the Society for the Welfare of the Patients of Ophthalmology.	Vice Chairperson
Dr. Hadi Bux Jatoi , Retired DG Health as Eminent Person.	Member
Mr. Zohaib Hassan Shaikh Deputy Secretary, Health Department, (Nominee of Honorable Secretary Health, Government of Sindh, Karachi.	Member
Prof. Dr. Sharif Hashmani Senior Ophthalmologist.	Member
Dr. Bashir Khaskheli Nominee of Pakistan Medical Association.	Member
Dr. Zahid Hussain Awan Nominee of INGO.	Member
Mrs. Nida Khoto Member of Provincial Assembly Sindh	Member

Prof. Dr. Sajjad Ali Surhio
Executive Director, Sindh Institute of
Ophthalmology & Visual Sciences Hyderabad.

Secretary / Member

2. The meeting commenced with the verses of the Holy Quran recited by Mr. Abdul Aleem Memon, Vice Chairperson, BoD, SIOVS Hyderabad. Prof. Dr. Sajjad Ali Surhio, Secretary of BoD, informed the Chairperson that as per Section 10 sub section 4 of SIOVS Act 2013, and as amended in 2019, the quorum for a meeting is one third of total number of members, whereas, out of fourteen (14) members, 09 members are attending the meeting.

3. The Executive Director, SIOVS briefed the members that the meeting has been convened by the honorable chairman for making decision on the one agenda i.e. Appointment/Re-appointment against the post of Executive Director, SIOVS. Afterwards, the Chairman of the Board, Secretary Health Department of Sindh requested the board to place the case of appointment against the Executive Director, SIOVS in chronological order.

a. Under Section 11 of The Sindh Institute of Ophthalmology and Visual Sciences Act, 2013, the Director(Executive Director), to be appointed by the Board on the prescribed terms and conditions, shall possess prescribed qualification from a University established by law in Pakistan or a University of International repute and shall have experience in the field of Ophthalmology and Visual Sciences institutions for at least ten years: Provided that the person holding office of the Professor of Ophthalmology of Liaquat University of Medical and Health Sciences, Jamshoro, immediately before the commencement of this Act shall be the first Director of the Institute(**Annexure-I**).

b. In terms of Rule 4(7) of Sindh Institute of Ophthalmology and Visual Sciences Employees (Terms and Conditions of Service) Rules 2021, the Executive Director shall be appointed by the Board under section 11 of the Act on following terms and conditions (**Annexure-II**): -

- i. He shall be appointed by the Board from amongst the Senior Professors of Institute having at least 10 years' experience in the field of Ophthalmology with sufficient administrative experience;
- ii. His appointment shall be approved as recommended by the Board and notified by the Health Department, Government of Sindh;
- iii. He shall enjoy the perks and privileges of BPS-22 and shall draw salary of MP-1 on his extraordinary achievements in the field of Ophthalmology;
- iv. That the Board shall recommend the re- appointment of eminently qualified person having experience in field of ophthalmology and has contributed to the Institute to the greater extent during the period, he

has remained the Executive Director, for a term of four (4) years with the perks and privileges as may be determined by the Board.

c. The Board of Directors, in its meeting decided to re-appoint Dr. Khalid Iqbal Talpur in view of his performance for the institute. The Health Department, Government of Sindh, in pursuance of the section 11 of the "Sindh Institute of Ophthalmology and Visual Sciences Act-2013" and on the recommendation / decision of Board of Directors dated 27.09.2020 and with the approval of Competent Authority i.e. Chief Minister Sindh, re-appointed Professor Dr. Khalid Iqbal Talpur as Executive Director, Sindh Institute of Ophthalmology and Visual Sciences (SIOVS), Hyderabad for the period of four (04) years w.e.f. 01.01.2021 to 31.12.2024 on usual terms and conditions **(Annexure-III)**.

d. It is pertinent to mention that the re-appointment of Professor Dr. Khalid Iqbal Talpur as Executive Director, Sindh Institute of Ophthalmology and Visual Sciences (SIOVS), Hyderabad was challenged in High Court of Sindh, Circuit Court at Hyderabad. The Honorable High Court in its Judgement in Constitutional Petition No. 1769 dated 24.12.2021 decided the matter with operative part narrated as under **(Annexure-IV)**:

" In view of the above, instant petition stands allowed, with directions to the competent authority to de-notify the re- appointment of respondent No.4 as Executive Director SIOVS forthwith and make appointment against the said post after advertising the post and observing all the codal formalities as provided under the law. The respondent No.4 would be free to compete such process"

e. In compliance to judgment dated 24.12.2021 passed by the Hon. High Court of Sindh, Circuit Court at Hyderabad in C.P No. 1769 of 2021, the Health Department, Government of Sindh de-notified the name of Professor Dr. Khalid Iqbal Talpur as Executive Director, Sindh Institute of Ophthalmology and Visual Sciences (SIOVS), Hyderabad, with immediate effect. And, Professor Dr. Sajjad Ali Surhio, Professor of Ophthalmology, Sindh Institute of Ophthalmology and Visual Sciences, Hyderabad was assigned to look after the charge of Executive Director, SIOVS, Hyderabad, with immediate effect as stopgap arrangement until appointment of the Executive Director, SIOVS, Hyderabad **(Annexure-V)**.

f. Afterwards, the Board of Directors, in its 10th meeting, decided the terms and conditions for the appointment against the post of Executive Director, SIOVS **(Annexure-VI)**.

- i. The candidate must be a Professor in Ophthalmology;
- ii. Have experience in maintaining coordination with high level medical institutions in order to promote eye health teaching, training, community work, research and publications;

- iii. Have at least 5 years of experience in senior academic, research, management leadership or administration in any CPSP recognized public sector Ophthalmic Post Graduate Institute in the leadership capacity;
- iv. Have at least 10 years of service working at Senior Level in Ophthalmology of any public or private sector Institute;
- v. The candidate shall not be more than 65 years of age on the last date fixed on the submission of applications;
- vi. The shall candidate possess post-graduation, i.e. FRCS/FCPS/M.S. in Ophthalmology or equivalent degree from any reputable and recognized national or foreign university;
- vii. The candidate must have experience of working with national and international bodies and must possess international exposure through participation in workshops, seminars, or conferences held outside of the country.

TERM OF APPOINTMENT AND SALARY

- i. The Executive Director shall be appointed for a period of four (04) years.
- ii. The Executive Director shall enjoy the perks and privileges of BPS- 22 and shall draw salary of MP-I.
- g. On the basis of the criteria, the advertisement for the post of Executive Director, SLOVS was published in the dailies, following aspirants applied who were interviewed by the Selection Committee (**Annexure-VII**).

- i. Prof. Dr. Khalid Iqbal Talpur.
- ii. Prof. Dr. Khan Muhammad Nangrejo
- iii. Prof. Dr. Shahid Azeem Mirza
- iv. Prof. Dr. Arshad Ali Lodhi
- v. Prof. Dr. Ashok Kumar Narsani
- vi. Prof. Dr. Sajjad Ali Surhio
- vii. Prof. Dr. Aurangzeb Shaikh.

It is pertinent to mention that 4 Out of Seven (7) candidates / aspirants following 03 were recommended by the Selection Committee as per 1st, 2nd & 3rd merit, respectively.

- i. Prof. Dr. Khalid Iqbal Talpur
- ii. Prof. Dr. Aurangzaib Shaikh
- iii. Prof. Dr. Ashok Kumar.

"The upshot of the above discussion is therefore as follows. The reasoning and analysis of the learned High Court cannot, with respect, be sustained. At the same time, the manner in which the Board has proceeded is also legally unsustainable. Enough time has already passed and therefore, if the whole exercise has to be started afresh that would leave the Institute without an ED for even longer. Accordingly, we convert this leave petition into an appeal and dispose it of as follows, in terms of what has been said above: the Board shall, if it is so minded, consider the case of Dr. Talpur for reappointment in terms of clause (iv) in terms as explained above. If, in the manner as so set out it is of the view that Dr. Talpur cannot or ought not to be considered for reappointment his case will come to an end. The Board shall then proceed to consider the shortlisted candidates (referred to in para 16 of the impugned judgment) for appointment in terms of clause (i). If however, in the manner set out above, the Board is of the view that Dr. Talpur can be considered for reappointment, it shall then proceed to consider the shortlisted candidates for appointment in terms of clause (1) and thereafter and thereupon make a decision for appointment or reappointment, as the case may be, in terms as set out and explained above. The detailed reasons in writing required (twice) from the Board must be made public by inter alia posting the same on the website of the Institute and, in particular, provided to Dr. Lodhi."

4. The Board of Director, SIOVS also deliberated on the matter of re-appointment/appointment against the post of Executive Director, SIOVS. It came under notice that the rules notified for the post of Executive Director, SIOVS does not bar the age limit; whereas, the Board in its 10th meeting has barred the age limit to 65 years for submission of application forms which are not part of the rules. Therefore, there is impliedly no as such bar on the age in light of notified rules. Secondly, the Supreme Court of Pakistan in CPLA 1417-k Of 2022 has authorized the Board SIOVS to consider the re-appointment of Prof. Dr. Khalid Iqbal Talpur if deemed appropriate. The Board has examined the record and found it appropriate to re-appoint Prof. Khalid Talpur for the position of Executive Director, SIOVS for a period of four years in view of his performance and in terms of Rule 4(7)(iv) of Sindh Institute of Ophthalmology and Visual Sciences Employees (Terms and Conditions of Service) Rules 2021. Thirdly, the Board has also examined the recommendations of Selection Committee who has placed Dr. Talpur on top of the merit against the post of Executive Director, SIOVS in response to the advertisement for the said position.

DECISION:

The Board of Director, SIOVS, in light of Supreme Court of Pakistan in CPLA 1417-k of 2022 and on the recommendation of the Selection Committee, has unanimously decided that Prof. Dr. Khalid Iqbal Talpur is re-appointed as Executive Director, SIOVS for the period of four years from the date of notification.

VOTE OF THANKS BY:

Professor Dr. Sajjad Ali Surhio, the Executive Director of the Institute thanked all the honorable members, especially Honorable Secretary, Health Department Government of Sindh/Chairperson, for his valuable guidance in favor of the Institute.